

**COMMENTS**  
**DRAFT 2009 FISH AND BLUE CRAB TISSUE CHEMISTRY DATA FOR THE LOWER PASSAIC RIVER STUDY AREA**  
**DATED SEPTEMBER 19, 2011**

<b>No.</b>	<b>General Comments</b>
1	At the end of each section focusing on a specific chemical or group of chemicals there is a brief discussion which mentions the highest values of the chemical detected in samples, and refers to the reach where that sample was located on its corresponding figure. The sample ID or location of samples discussed is not provided which makes it difficult to pin point on the figures which sample had the highest concentration. For example, on page 173 the text states that the highest white perch total PCB congener concentration (5,100 µg/kg) was detected in a whole-body composite sample from Reach 5 and references Figure 4-37. Review of Figure 4-37 indicates that there are 3 samples within Reach 5 with concentrations >2,800 µg/kg, yet there is no way to tell which sample had the concentration of 5,100 µg/kg. Please revise the appropriate sections of texts or corresponding figures to clarify where the samples were collected.
2	There are several instances in the text when a concentration of a specific chemical is mentioned, but its corresponding value in associated tables does not match due to inconsistencies in rounding. For example, on page 57 it is stated that cadmium was detected in 41.7% of fish fillet samples; however, Table 4-2 says 42%. Another example is chromium. On page 67 the text states that chromium concentrations in all fish and crab tissues ranged from a low of 0.016 mg/kg; however, Table 4-2 says 0.02 mg/kg. Please revise all sections to keep values mentioned in the text and tables consistent with one another.
3	The final memorandum documenting the requirements/decisions for fish and crab sample compositing and analysis should be included as an appendix to the document. The tables showing actual samples and resulting composites should also be included.
4	There appears to be some information missing from the report: The results of the PCDD/PCDF analysis are incomplete; either data are missing for some of the dioxin/furan samples or the results were non-detect, but this was not indicated on the tables; and identification and tabulation of the individual PCB coplanar compounds was missing. Please review and update, as necessary.

<b>No.</b>	<b>Page No.</b>	<b>Specific Comments</b>
5	Table 1-1	Under the Column titled "QAPP/Sampling Plan Citation" AECOM's QAPPs for RM 10.9 and small-volume CWCM are listed as in preparation. Please revise with the correct dates as both the draft and final RM 10.9 and small-volume CWCM QAPPs have been completed.
6	Page 57, Paragraph 1, second sentence	Text states the detection frequency of cadmium in fillet samples ranged from 0 to 41.7 percent. Review of the Table 4-2 indicates cadmium was detected in fillet samples at frequencies ranging from 9 to 74 percent. Please revise accordingly.
7	Page 107, Paragraph 1, second sentence	Text states tributyltin (TBT) was detected in all samples at a frequency ranging from 50 to 100 percent. Review of Table 4-3 indicates TBT was detected in all samples at frequencies ranging from 57 to 100 percent. Please revise accordingly.
8	Page 141, Paragraph 1, fourth sentence	Text states the highest total concentration of HPAHs (690 µg/kg) was detected in a blue crab carcass sample. Review of Table 4-4 indicates a concentration of 690 µg/kg was also detected in a blue crab hepatopancreas sample. Please revise accordingly.
9	Page 163, Section 4.4 SVOCs	The text summarizes the results of SVOC analysis of tissue and states that only one SVOC (benzaldehyde) was detected in blue crab tissues, and two SVOCs (benzaldehyde and bis(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate) were detected in fish tissues. Review of Appendix F indicates that detection limits for SVOCs in tissues are extremely high; however, the text fails to mention this. It is recommended that additional text be included in the summary of SVOC results which

		discuss the high detection limits.
10	Page 173, Paragraph 1, last sentence	Please reference Figure 4-38 at the end of sentence similar to what was done when referencing Figures 4-36 and 4-37 in previous sentences.
11	Page 201, Section 4.7 Organochlorine Pesticides	Please provide a justification as to why the discussion of results is only limited to total DDx, total chlordane, and dieldrin.
12	Page 244, Paragraph 1, last sentence	Please reference Figure 4-50 at the end of sentence similar to what was done when referencing Figures 4-48 and 4-49 in previous sentences.
13	Page 251, Third bullet, second sentence	Text states that the highest concentration of dieldrin (91 µg/kg) was detected in a white catfish carcass sample. Review of Table 4-9 indicates channel catfish. Please revise accordingly.
14	Page 259, Section 4.8 Lipids and Percent Moisture	Suggest either removing percent moisture from the section title and table or discussing the percent moisture results as it is not currently discussed nor it is clear why this data is presented.
15	Page 270, Section 5.6 SVOCs	It is recommended that text be included in this section discussing the high detection limits which resulted in only two compounds being detected in all samples.